

APPEAL HEARING

3rd APRIL 2019, 2 p.m.

Kelvin Malone Bridge Club

Those present

Panel; Pat Johnston, Anne Hassan, Nuala Mooney, Christine Crockett, Norma Irwin (chair)

Appellant: John Murchan

League Organiser; Ian Hamilton

Competitions secretary; Liz Scott

On March 26th 2019, Council appointed a panel Anne Hassan, Nuala Mooney, Pat Johnston, Christine Crockett and Norma Irwin (Chair) to hear an appeal. These are members of Council who do not play in Premier 1 league. This appeal was made by John Murchan, Captain of the league team, to Council on 15th March.

The appeal by John Murchan is against the ruling made by the League Organiser, Ian Hamilton, on 29th January about the eligibility of a member of John's team, Nathan Doyle, to play in the league match on 24th January.

This panel was given access to the submissions made to the L and E committee for the appeal held on 21st February. Both John and Ian were asked if they wished to add to these submissions and neither did. Also they were asked if they intended to bring any witnesses to the appeal, L.O. brought Liz Scott, Competitions Secretary for the Union.

The chair made an opening statement (see above) adding that “unlike L and E we do not have a code of practice or a set of standing orders to which to adhere. We will be using the submissions from John and Ian, which we have perused at length. We will be asking pertinent questions and using, above all else, our common sense. Also no unpleasant, personal remarks will be tolerated by the panel.”

L.O. asked if L. and E. committee should be represented.

Chair explained that panel's brief was to hear the submissions regarding Nathan Doyle's eligibility to play as a substitute on the league Team. The ruling from L. and E. was not under consideration.

John Murchan gave his statement, occasional referring to background details which were ignored as irrelevant by the panel.

Ian Hamilton gave his statement on the sequence of events after the league match, when the score slips had been delivered to him late on 24th January.

Liz Scott was invited to speak and she briefly related her conversation with L.O. regarding the fact that Nathan Doyle was not a registered player at the time of the match.

Questions were then asked by the panel.

- ◆ The eligibility of the other members of John's team
- ◆ Harold Curran's reaction on receiving the registration money
- ◆ The general timing between registration and getting MP number
- ◆ How frequently Harold registers his members

Both John and Ian were invited to give summary comments, neither thought it was necessary. They then left the meeting as did Liz.

After studying the submissions again, including those from Harold Curran and Anne Fitzpatrick the panel unanimously agreed on the ruling as set out below.

With the information that L.O.Ian Hamilton had at that time, the action he took was without fault. However we feel there were exceptional circumstances which prevented Harold Curran acting as he normally would. Hence the player was not registered with the NIBU on 24th January 2019, the day of the league match but his money had been paid to Harold that day and John had spoken to Harold re the player on 22nd, 2 days before match.

The panel has ruled that, as John Murchan thought his player was registered as a member of the Quoil International club, he fielded him in good faith. Therefore the original match score should stand and John should have his deposit returned.

The chair read the ruling to all and closed the hearing at 3.20 p.m.

Norma Irwin 05-04-19

Points raised which Council may want to consider.

1. It is essential that only one set of rules is published on our web site, obviously those to be used during the playing season.
2. The note on the league entry form must be corrected or removed.
3. There should be some guidance on 'confliction'. Our Union is so small and so many of us know each other well, play together and are on the same committees, teams leagues etc. to produce a panel of non-conflicted personnel is almost impossible.

