

Minutes of Tournament Committee 18th October 2018

Present: - Liz Scott (chair), David Leeman, Ian Hamilton, Ken Hammond (co-opted), Anne Hassan, Helen Hall.

Observers:- Harold Curran (NIBU Chairman), Michael McFaul (NIBU Hon Secretary)

Apologies :- Brian McDowell, Barbara Ewart

The meeting was opened by the TC chairman, Liz Scott, at 2:30 pm.

The only items on the agenda were the consideration of NIBU Leagues Rules amendment proposals and suggestions by Rex Anderson and the League Organiser. The Committee was asked to consider what possible Rules amendments were required and to submit their recommendations to the Laws & Ethics Committee for consideration.

The Tournament Committee's unanimous recommendations are summarised below.

NIBU League Rules

Ian Hamilton's suggested amendments	TC Opinion
1. Council referred 2.1.2 back to L&E. This relates to the number of teams in Premier Leagues 1 and 2. The Council was of the view that, in the absence of a Senior League, one or more additional teams could play in Prem 2. It was not spelt out by Council but it would seem sensible that a discretionary clause be incorporated giving the Organiser/Competitions Sec. some latitude as regards the number of teams in P2. It is immaterial at present, but could become relevant again.	Agreed
2. Council referred back Rule 5.2.2 for clarification. This seems to have been essentially been done by the L&E ruling in the appeal by Rex to the Committee. They held that an originally designated player who plays less than 1/3 of the matches be re-classified at season end as a substitute, and therefore not a regular team member. However, this Rule could perhaps be re-written making this clearer.	Agreed
3. 5.2.2 perhaps needs expanded and further clarified, or an additional sub-Rule added. It is not clearly expressed how many substitutes are permitted in any one team. The intention was that they be unlimited. This needs spelt out more clearly, and tidied up. See 4. It should be spelt out that no substitute can play for more than one team in a season. Otherwise, they could play a match for team A, then 3 matches for team B, becoming a regular player, which seems wrong. Alternatively, a substitute can play for more than one team, but up to a maximum of twice. I am not in favour of the latter.	Not necessary
4. There are potentially 28 match players per team per season. Therefore, four regular members could play the minimum 3 matches to qualify as regular members. It would then be possible for as many as a further five substitutes to each play at least 3 matches and qualify as regular members as well. A Rule should forbid more than 6 members playing three or more matches for a team in a season. Any match played	Agreed

with a 7 th or further deemed regular player should be forfeit as in 6. below.	
5. Rule 6.4.3 allows illness substitutes. A substitute in these circumstances should be regarded as a full substitute for the purposes of Masterpoints and matches played for a team as a substitute (or regular member) so long as they play at least half of the boards. The original player shall be considered to have played the match if they play at least half of the boards. If they both play exactly half of the boards, both qualify.	Agreed
6. Rule 5.6 only allows a relegated player to play in the league from which they have been relegated a maximum of two matches as a substitute. No penalty is stated should a relegated player exceed this. It would seem logical that any such subsequent matches played be treated as concessions by the offending team, they awarded OVP, their opponents 12VP or their average (whichever is greater). This needs spelt out. In addition, should a player in a lower League play three or more matches in a higher League as a sub, therefore becoming a regular player, should there be sanctions on his lower League team, and if so what? (TC addition)	Agreed
7. Are the concession Rules unfair to the innocent team? Instead of 12 VP, adjusted up if necessary to the team's average, could one instead use the average score of the offending team's opponents in matches played? Last year several teams conceded when they were in a hopeless position, damaging their opponent's chance of a big score. For example: Drew Lindsay vs Scott in P1.	Agreed

Rex Anderson's PROPOSALS for League rules amendments

The League Rules are set up so that the same boards are played by each team in the different leagues. The match dates are fixed when the season commences and can only be changed in specific emergency circumstances. Each team is permitted to play an unlimited number of substitutes so that there is no need for any match not to be played.	
	TC Opinion
Entry date Entry date to for all leagues to be at least 8 weeks prior to first league match night to allow time for any playoffs required. Is 8 weeks long enough?	No need to change.
Number of teams in each league There should be 8 teams in PL1. Each other League may have a maximum of 10 teams. It is essential to keep to the 7 fixed nights for league matches. See schedule hereunder for set up for specific numbers of teams in a league	Agreed but left the setup to the Organiser's discretion.
Eligibility for Premier Division 1 The Premier Division 1 is supposed to comprise the teams of the best players in the Union. Clearly that is not the case presently. <p>[1] Any team which includes 4 players who have played in the previous year's Camrose, Lady Milne or Teltscher shall be permitted to join PL1.</p> <p>[2] If such a team joins PL1 then the lowest non-relegated team from</p>	Not agreed

<p>the previous team shall be relegated to PL2.</p>	
<p>Changes in personnel in all leagues 2.1.3 Each of the Senior, Intermediate A, Intermediate B and Novice Leagues shall normally consist of one division. There may be more than one division in the leagues other than the PL. Should the Rules on break up of teams apply to all leagues in which there is more than one division rather than to just PL alone?</p>	<p>Agreed</p>
<p>Designation of team members Rule 5.1.1 Every team must designate, in writing to the Secretary on or before a specified date, 4, at least, of its members as regular members. Omit all Each member of a team accepted to play in a league who plays in at least one third of the matches in a league and each substitute member of a team who plays in at least one third of the matches in a league shall have rights in decisions pertaining to changes in personnel. Should it be one third of the matches or one half of the matches?</p>	<p>Agreed It should be 1/3 of the matches</p>
<p>Rule 5.12 ‘Regular players’ Rule 5.12.1 Only team members designated as regular members in the previous season have rights in decisions pertaining to changes in personnel. Omit all A team is only deemed to remain in being if a majority of the players (at least 3 of those designated as regular members who have played in at least one third of the matches in the previous season) wish to continue playing together. – Should it be one third or one half of the matches?</p>	<p>Agreed It should be 1/3 of the matches</p>
<p>SCHEDULE FOR LEAGUES WITH less than 8 teams</p> <p>4 TEAMS Double round robin and on last night Swiss to determine winner. All VP scores count</p> <p>5 TEAMS One round robin and then 3 Swiss rounds. All VP scores count</p> <p>6 TEAMS One round robin and then 3 Swiss rounds. All VP scores count</p> <p>7 TEAMS One round robin and then last night Swiss to determine winner. All VP scores count</p> <p>SCHEDULE FOR LEAGUES WITH 8 teams or more</p> <p>8 TEAMS One round robin</p>	<p>Not agreed. Playing arrangements to be at the Organiser’s discretion.</p>

<p>9 TEAMS Divide into 2 equal ability sections seeded according to master points one with 5 teams and one with 4 teams. One round robin and then the top 2 teams in each section play a further round robin. The team omitted receives a refund of one half of entry fee</p> <p>10 TEAMS Divide into 2 equal ability sections seeded according to master points. One round robin and then the top 2 teams in each section play a further round robin. The teams omitted may opt to receive a refund of one half of entry fee or to play each other over the last 3 nights</p>	<p>See above</p>
--	------------------

No date was set for any future meeting

There being no further business the meeting was declared closed at 3:50pm.

Liz Scott (Competitions Secretary and Chairman Tournament Committee Chairman)